National Letter in Support of Federal All-Payer Claims Database

As health scholars, leaders of health organizations, and funders of health research, we are writing in support of establishing a federal all-payer claims database (APCD).

APCDs regularly collect data on health insurance claims from all of the payers in a given area (typically a state). Because they include demographic and diagnostic data on patients as well as any treatment or drug paid for by insurance (private or public), APCDs can be immensely valuable for research. APCDs have been used by health scholars to study numerous issues about quality and cost, including the extent of long-term opioid use after surgery, the ability of Medicaid patients to access physicians, the amount of wasted medical spending ending on low-value care, the performance of new models to reduce health spending (such as patient-centered medical home programs), the rate of complications after routine surgeries, and the characteristics of the highest-cost Medicaid patients.

In 2016, however, the Supreme Court rendered it all but impossible for states to establish comprehensive APCDs, on the grounds that the Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA) preempted states from requiring reporting by self-insured health plans. As noted in the Journal of the American Medical Association, this Supreme Court decision has “far-reaching implications for the ability of states to access comprehensive health information to inform policy making.”

In May 2019, the Senate Health, Education, Labor and Pensions Committee released a draft of the Lower Health Care Costs Act. Among other things, that Act would amend ERISA to create a federal APCD whose data would be available to “researchers and policymakers.”

While we are not all able to take a position on specific federal legislation, we can all agree that a national APCD would be an enormous leap forward for the ability of health researchers to study the cost and quality of medical care across the U.S. As noted above, smaller and more limited APCDs at the state level have been used for a wide variety of health studies that shed light on health care markets and the quality of care received; simultaneously, national studies often rely on Medicare data, which is limited in other ways (i.e., to older populations). A national APCD would enable a new generation of health research that could combine the strengths of Medicare/Medicaid data and state-level data on claims paid by private insurers.

We do have one reservation about the Lower Health Care Costs Act, in its current draft. It requires data to be de-identified pursuant to HIPAA standards, which would mean stripping out useful information on items like locations and birth dates, thus making it much more difficult to research certain questions.
This seems an unnecessary limitation: This type of information is regularly available in Medicare claims data, and given the privacy protections in place, health scholars have successfully used that data with no privacy breaches to date.

That said, we strongly support a national APCD, and would be willing to testify as to its potential merits.

Signed,

Adam Leive, University of Virginia
Alan Monheit, Rutgers University School of Public Health
Alan Sorensen, University of Wisconsin, Madison
Albert Ma, Boston University
Amanda Starc, Kellogg School of Management, Northwestern University
Amitabh Chandra, Harvard University
Amresh Hanchate, Boston University School of Medicine
Amy Finkelstein, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Ashley Leech, Vanderbilt University School of Medicine
Ashley Swanson, Columbia Business School
Austin Frakt, Boston University School of Public Health
Ben Handel, University of California, Berkeley
Benedic Ippolito, American Enterprise Institute
Benjamin Solow, University of Iowa
Chapin White, RAND; Freepricer LLC
Charles E. Phelps, University of Rochester
Christopher J. Ruhm, University of Virginia
Christopher Manz, University of Pennsylvania
Cindy Parks Thomas, Heller School for Social Policy and Management, Brandeis University
Daniel Polsky, Johns Hopkins University
David Anderson, Duke Margolis Center for Health Policy
David Cutler, Harvard University
David Dranove, Northwestern University
Dominic Hodgkin, Heller School for Social Policy and Management, Brandeis University
Elena Prager, Kellogg School of Management, Northwestern University
Ethan Lieber, University of Notre Dame
Gautam Gowrisankaran, Department of Economics, University of Arizona
Genevieve M. Kenney, Health Policy Center, The Urban Institute
Haizhen Lin, Indiana University
Hannah Neprash, University of Minnesota School of Public Health
Harold Pollack, University of Chicago
Helen Levy, Institute for Social Research, University of Michigan
Jaime S. King, University of California, Hastings, Law
James B. Rebitzer, Questrom School of Business, Boston University
James Marton, Andrew Young School of Policy Studies, Georgia State University
Jamie Daw, Columbia Mailman School of Public Health
Janet Currie, Princeton University
Jay Bhattacharya, Stanford University
Jill Horwitz, University of California, Los Angeles
John Cawley, Cornell University
John Graves, Vanderbilt University School of Medicine
John Mullahy, University of Wisconsin, Madison
Jonathan Kolstad, University of California, Berkeley, Haas School of Business
Jonathan Skinner, Dartmouth College
Joseph P. Newhouse, Harvard University
Justin Wolfers, University of Michigan
K. John McConnell, Center for Health Systems Effectiveness, Oregon Health & Science University
Kate Ho, Princeton University
Keith Marzilli Ericson, Questrom School of Business, Boston University
Kimberley Geissler, University of Massachusetts-Amherst School of Public Health and Health Sciences
Kiruba Dharaneeeswaran, University of Pennsylvania
Leemore Dafny, Harvard University
Len M. Nichols, Center for Health Policy Research and Ethics, George Mason University
Leslie I. Boden, Boston University School of Public Health
Linda Blumberg, Health Policy Center, The Urban Institute
Liran Einav, Stanford University
Loren Adler, USC-Brookings Schaeffer Initiative for Health Policy
Louise Sheiner, The Brookings Institution
M. Kate Bundorf, Stanford University School of Medicine
Maria Polyakova, Stanford University School of Medicine
Marilyn Schlein Kramer, Massachusetts Center for Health Information and Analysis
Mark Satterthwaite, Northwestern University
Mark Miller, Arnold Ventures
Mark V. Pauly, The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania
Martin Gaynor, Carnegie Mellon University
Matthew Fiedler, The Brookings Institution
Matthew Grennan, The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania
Maureen Stewart, Heller School for Social Policy and Management, Brandeis University
Melissa Garrido, Boston University School of Public Health
Michael Chernew, Department of Health Care Policy, Harvard Medical School
Michaela Kerrissey, Harvard TH Chan School of Public Health
Milan Kapadia, Hospital for Special Surgery
Monica Galizzi, University of Massachusetts, Lowell
Morgan Shields, Heller School for Social Policy and Management, Brandeis University
Naomi Zewde, Columbia University
Neale Mahoney, Booth School of Business, University of Chicago
Nicholas Bagley, University of Michigan Law School
Nicholas Tilipman, School of Public Health, University of Illinois at Chicago
Osea Giuntella, University of Pittsburgh
Paul B. Ginsburg, The Brookings Institution
Paul Karner, HORIZON Data Science Applications
Peter Hussey, Johns Hopkins University
Randall P Ellis, Boston University
You can add your support to this letter here.